

AI Tool Evaluation Scorecard

A Framework for Choosing the Right AI Tools

By Justin P. Barrett | justinbarrett.com | Alive LLC

How to Use This Scorecard

Rate each AI tool you're evaluating on the criteria below (1-5 scale). Compare total scores to make data-driven purchasing decisions. Weight the criteria based on what matters most to your business.

Evaluation Criteria

- 1. Core Functionality (Weight: 3x)**
Does it solve the specific problem you need solved? Rate the quality of its primary function.
- 2. Ease of Use (Weight: 2x)**
Can your team start using it within a day? Is the learning curve reasonable?
- 3. Integration (Weight: 2x)**
Does it connect with your existing tools (CRM, email, Slack, etc.)? API available?
- 4. Data Privacy & Security (Weight: 3x)**
Where is your data stored? Is it used for training? SOC 2 compliant? GDPR compliant?
- 5. Pricing & ROI (Weight: 2x)**
What's the monthly cost per user? What's the estimated time savings in dollars?
- 6. Scalability (Weight: 1x)**
Will it grow with you? What are the limits on usage, users, or features at each tier?
- 7. Support & Documentation (Weight: 1x)**
Is there good documentation, tutorials, and responsive support when things break?
- 8. Output Quality (Weight: 3x)**
Is the AI output good enough to use with minimal editing? Consistent?
- 9. Customization (Weight: 1x)**
Can you customize it for your specific use case, brand voice, or domain?
- 10. Vendor Stability (Weight: 1x)**
Is the company funded, profitable, and likely to exist in 2 years? How mature is the product?

Scorecard Template

Tool Name: _____
Date Evaluated: _____
Evaluated By: _____
Use Case: _____

Criteria	Score (1-5)	Weight	Weighted Score
Functionality	___	3x	___
Ease of Use	___	2x	___
Integration	___	2x	___

Data Privacy	___	3x	___
Pricing/ROI	___	2x	___
Scalability	___	1x	___
Support	___	1x	___
Output Quality	___	3x	___
Customization	___	1x	___
Vendor Stability	___	1x	___

%%%%%%%%%

TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE: ___ / 95

Decision: & Adopt & Trial & Pass

Notes: _____

Red Flags to Watch For

- No clear data privacy policy or SOC 2 certification
- Requires uploading sensitive customer data with no encryption
- No API or integration options — you'll be locked into manual workflows
- Pricing that scales unpredictably with usage
- Company founded less than 1 year ago with no significant funding
- Output quality degrades significantly outside of demo scenarios

About the Author

Justin P. Barrett is an entrepreneur, artist, and author. As CEO of Eyesafe, he built the global standard for display health technology. As founder of Alive LLC, he helps lean teams implement AI systems that actually work — agent architectures, knowledge bases, and automation workflows.

justinbarrett.com | justin@justinbarrett.com